

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): Parents' and Teachers' Perspectives

Dr. Muhammad Makki Kakar

Doctoral Researcher Sociology, Centre of Excellence for Results Based Management,
University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan.

Email: makkikakar@gmail.com

Dr. Farhan Navid Yousaf

Associate Professor, Institute of Social and Cultural Studies, University of the Punjab,
Lahore, Pakistan.

Email: drfarhan.iscs@pu.edu.pk

Dr. Muhammad Shoaib

Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.

Email: shoaibsoc@uog.edu.pk

Received on: 26-01-2022

Accepted on: 28-02-2022

Abstract

This qualitative study aimed to highlight parents' and teachers' perspectives on school reforms during 2013-2020 in Balochistan. This study is informed by the epistemological cannons of interpretivists' tradition. In this research, qualitative research design is used, and exploratory research method is employed. A sample size of 20 participants was interviewed through In-depth interview schedule that includes ten parents and teachers each working in public schools. Moreover, purposive sampling technique was employed to interview the Teachers and parents whose children are studying in public schools. Thus, the data were recorded, transcribed, and interpreted through thematic analysis. The study found that free text provision, teacher training, teachers capacity building, the medium of instruction, infrastructure provision, curriculum development, monitoring, and evaluation system still require great attention of the concerned authority to properly implement the reforms and promote literacy in the area. The study suggests that the education sector plan should be seriously implemented with the provision of required resources to observe the prosperous future of Balochistan public schools.

Keywords: Curriculum, Evaluation, Infrastructure, Monitoring, Reforms, Textbook.

Introduction

Education has been a significant factor to bring change by reforming society for ages. Globally, change is attributed to the well-designed education system producing effective reforms and policies. Similarly, Gleeson, Klenowski, and Looney (2020) revealed that the smooth

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

execution of the reforms and policies bore fruitful in the long run where the societies developed and progressed. Moreover, it strengthens the structure of social institutions particularly the educational institutions (Karacabey, Bellibaş, & Adams, 2020; Kauppinen, Kainulainen, Hökkä, & Vähäsantanen, 2020). Farooqi and Forbes (2020) argued that the educational reforms have a significant role to bring productive changes in the social structure, on the verge of the future of the nation (Knight, 2020). So, developed nations have utilized resources to develop the educational institutions through reforms (Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Lopes & Oliveira, 2020), to produce the knowledge and execute the reforms to bring change among the people. Thus, it is pertinent to mention here that education is an important benchmark to reshape the fabric of society across the globe (Mankki, Mäkinen, & Rähkä, 2020; Marklund, 2020). In the developed world, reforms in education proved beneficial to cope with the contemporary challenges in education and design strategies to deal with the issues by taking radical measures (McGarr & Ó Gallchóir, 2020; McMullen & Eaton, 2020). Similarly, Roberts and King (2020) revealed that education reforms constructed the social, moral, and rational aspects in society time and again (Muckenthaler, Tillmann, Weiß, & Kiel, 2020; Oliemat, Al-Zboon, & Al-Dababneh, 2020). Since it is argued that the socio-economic development of society is framed through affective educational reforms (Paredes-Chi & Viga-de Alva, 2020; Proctor, Roch, Breidenstein, & Forsey, 2020).

Unlike the developed world, developing countries are struggling to reform the education system on the lines of developed countries. It is evident from the reforms of Honk Kong, South Korea and Singapore where school reforms brought a visible change in public schools. On the other hand, most of the developing countries, despite initiated reforms, could not restructure the public schools. As the mechanism of reforms generally and particularly the education reforms in public schools are intact but remarkable outcomes are not attained so far. Although reforms in public schools have been undertaken by India however, the positive outcomes have not been achieved. Similarly, education system of Sri Lanka underwent school reforms for the last few decades while left behind the considerable loopholes. A similar situation is found in Iran where reforms in public schools need to be revisited. Moreover, the school reforms in Bangladesh could not bring about a considerable change in public schools. Like other developing countries, the situation in Pakistan is not different. Since the existence of Pakistan, although education policies were framed not even a single education policy was implemented in its spirit to bring the reforms generally in education and particularly in schools. Owing to policy failure, like other provinces Baluchistan has also been vulnerable to the micro and macro level of structuring the educational system and particularly schools. Presently, school children of Baluchistan [Quota] are still at risk and need large scale reforms to educate the children to ensure inevitable and inalienable rights. This province is among the least developed regions of Pakistan with a lack of infrastructure, and staffing is nevertheless trained and qualified. Besides, there is no mechanism of monitoring and bridging the school staff with parents to discuss the problems confronted by the last few decades and initiate reform of school structure. Thus, this research attempted to examine parents' and teachers' perspectives of school reforms in Balochistan from 2013-2020. The Balochistan is least developed among the four provinces of Pakistan (Jabeen, 2020). It is reported that a total of 31,551 (42% in public and 58% private sector) high schools are functional and total enrollment 3.325 million (68% in public and 32% in the private sector)

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

in Pakistan along with 560,642 (43% in public and 57% in the private sector) teachers (Education, 2018). Furthermore, the dropout and enrollment rate in Balochistan is at the bottom of the four provinces of Pakistan (Mughal, 2020). Moreover, it is pertinent to mention here that only 1,091 high schools (with total of 2,195 classrooms) are in Balochistan with an enrollment of 75,651 students and the total number of teachers 22,948 (Education, 2018).

Research Questions

This study is guided by the following research questions in line with the reformation at the public-school level.

1. Do the government authorities of education department provide the free textbooks to students at elementary school level?
2. Does government ensure the transparent recruitment of teachers in schools?
3. How the teachers are provided training opportunities along with smooth working/teaching environment, including infrastructure, for the quality education at schools?
4. What is the mechanism of bridging the teachers and parents to enhance the cooperation to know and evaluate the performance of the student in schools?
5. How effective monitoring and evaluation system exist at elementary school level?

Review of Literature

A substantial body of literature has been conducted on school reforms in the developing and developed world (e.g., Puad & Ashton, 2020; Roberts & King, 2020). This heap of literature shows that the school reforms have been taken up by both developed and developing countries. However, the situation is different in developed and developing countries. As developed nations have achieved benchmarks by reforming the public schools thus their education system further developed. On the other hand, the education system in developing countries despite of efforts and considerable spending, still remain ineffective. A large number of studies have been conducted on different aspects of the reforms related issues in public schools across the world. It also included studies conducted on qualified teaching staff, research-based education, incompetent administration, financial budget, examination standards, educational facilities (Rushton & Reiss, 2020; Schachter, Flynn, Napoli, & Piasta, 2020; Sheppard, Wolfinger, & Talbert, 2020). Moreover, Abdullah (2020) asserted that multiform frameworks of education in Pakistan are the source of inequality and the main hurdle to unanimous reforms (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Smyth, 2020). A great issue of the medium is being faced by the students in public, private, and Madrassas. For example, Urdu is a medium of instruction in public schools and English in private schools while Arabic in Madrassas (Puad & Ashton, 2020). Similarly, it is also an issue in Iran where Persian is the language and Saudi Arabia and other Gulf countries where the education is in the local languages. Moreover, the issue also exists in India and most of the African countries where the policies are made according to the international standards but when applied these misfits with the existing system. These either don't correlate with the local system or have the higher standard order that are not met by the schools. In Pakistan, education is perceived as a source of materialism rather than the inevitable basic right according to the religious injections [Holy Quran] and the universal declaration of human rights (UDHR). Thus, there exists a wide

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

gap in reforming the school education either on the religious or modern lines. Although, efforts are made in every regime to restructure the public-school policy however it has never been equitable. So, here is the point to ponder about the unanimous education policy enforcing an undisputed syllabus that will equally benefit the humans and society (Xiong, Warwick, & Chalties, 2020; Yuen, Lee, & Chung, 2020). It is thus found from research that most of the developing countries either set the international standards in reforms or miss the local context and leading towards failure to achieve the considerable goals. As it will address the issues of poor educational policies, shortage of quality instructors, lack of scientific laboratories are such components that declined the significance of compulsory education in society (Stunell, 2020; Su, Guo, & Wang, 2020; Szeto, Sin, & Leung, 2020; Wills, 2020).

According to Jabeen (2020), Pakistan is found low proficient in comparison to other developing nations i.e., India, Sri Lanka, Iran, South Africa. For example, low financial budget, poor quality of educational projects, incompetent administration, and supervision contribute to less proficiency of the country in Pakistan (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Smyth, 2020; Stavrou, 2020). Similarly, the imbalance of three different levels of education including public, private, and religious proved obstacles in transforming the system (Smits & Janssenswillen, 2020). Moreover, such disparities obstructed the unanimous system of education in Pakistan followed by the ill intention of the legislators (Rushton & Reiss, 2020; Schachter et al., 2020; Sheppard et al., 2020). Worldwide, education is a three-tier process i.e., primary, secondary, and higher secondary. As primary education is considered the cornerstone in education and the rest of the secondary and higher level is built on it (Roberts & King, 2020). In education, monitoring and evaluation have a significant impact on the construction of education reforms and policies by providing the base to sort out the loopholes and address in the reform process (Stunell, 2020). Therefore, the mechanism of monitoring and evaluation is only documented and unable to evaluate the progress of the education department (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Sheppard et al., 2020). Besides, the inclusion of parents and teachers in the development of the new curriculum and its implementation may bear fruitful results to the school reforms (Kauppinen et al., 2020; Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Mankki et al., 2020).

Worldwide, literature revealed that various societies took initiatives of educational reforms and successfully executed and found the greater outcomes in transforming the education system (Erdreich, 2020; Gleeson et al., 2020; Henderson, Williams, & Bradshaw, 2020). Elacqua, Sánchez, and Santos (2020) unveiled those educational reforms in developed countries paved the way forward to the development of education. Similar reforms might patronize the education system in developing countries. Jang (2020) argued that the minor reforms in the traditional educational system may give rise to scientific reforms. It may be advantageous to the students' learning and achievements on a large scale (Sakirudeen & Uwe, 2020). Reforms in the education system would turn the educational system technologically and scientifically sound (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Proctor et al., 2020; Roberts & King, 2020). While reforming, the curriculum bureau/wing may prove helpful to introduced different new methods of teaching (Sheppard et al., 2020; Smyth, 2020; Stunell, 2020). Similarly, many reforms such as public and private financial resources available for training and education of teachers might be introduced (Masbirorotni et al., 2020; Proctor et al., 2020). Consequently, a quality education system would fulfill the demand for educated

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

professionals and skilled laborers to compete with the national and international market and a benchmark of equality would be achieved (Mankki et al., 2020; Stunell, 2020).

Since the inception of Pakistan, a series of education policies were developed to meet the challenges in the education system (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020; Mughal, 2020), however not even a single educational policy was implemented so far. Almost all the policies were developed for five years of plans (Tripathi & Raghuvanshi, 2020). Unfortunately, such policies were not able to define the unanimous education system in Pakistan and yet to meet the international standards of education (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020; Khan et al., 2020). As the constitution of the state-guaranteed the right to education according to article 37 b & c of the 1973 constitution by taking responsibility to eradicate illiteracy and ensure the provision of all sorts of education. It is also coupled with improving the quality of textbooks, an increase in education funds, provision of teacher training, and compulsory primary education (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020; Khan et al., 2020).

Since the 18th amendment in Pakistan, education was subjected to the provinces by the federal government. Soon after the development, the Balochistan education sector plan (2013-2018) was launched for five years by the collation government of Balochistan in 2013. It aimed to introduce reforms in the education sector to improve the quality of education. Major educational reforms include an increase in enrollment ratio, up-gradation of schools, provision of infrastructure, provision of textbooks, curriculum development, instrumental scientific laboratories, recruitment transparency, free cheating environment, the proper medium of instruction, gender unbiased school education, teachers training, monitoring and evaluation and inclusive education (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020). This policy plan is still not executed to reform the schools to draw some robust results.

Materials and Methods

This research was fashioned in the epistemological cannons of interpretivist tradition. In this tradition, the phenomenon was explored by using qualitative research design while an exploratory research method was employed to know about the problems being faced by the teachers and parents in the public sector school of Balochistan. In this research, we Included two important stakeholders as the participants comprising parents and teachers. The objective was to know about the teachers' and parents' perspective on the school reforms. A sample size of 20-25 was selected for the study by using the purposive sampling technique. Owing to the nature of phenomenon being explored, an insight of the problem was required, thus, we designed and employed the in-depth interview guide to gather the data from participants. The ethical approval was taken from each participant on the page associate with the interview guide. However, every participant was asked to read the statement of research ethics that further keeps the indemnity and information of the participant anonymous. After compete understanding and approval, the participants were interviewed. The interview guide consisted ----- questions. Among the 20-25 participants, 20 participants i.e., 10 teachers and 10 parents of students from different public sector schools in the Quetta district of Balochistan province were interviewed. As saturation was achieved on every 10th participant both in the case of Teachers and Parents. All these schools were affiliated with the Balochistan Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BBISE), Quetta. Similarly, the teachers were from a few of these schools working as Senior School Teachers (SSTs), and those parents were

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

interviewed whose children were students in these schools. This research was conducted from April 2020 to July 2020. Each interview lasted for 40-60 minutes, and each participant was interviewed once. The participants, senior schoolteachers (SSTs), were selected from the different public sector schools. By using in-depth interviews as a technique of data collection in order to obtain information from the participants. We captured the personal experiences of each participant in audio tape while notes were also taken. To maintain the accuracy, all the interviews were recorded with the consent of the participants. Another purpose of recording was to overcome the natural limitation and human memories and the intuitive glosses that may have occurred because of listening and writing. As the transcribed interviews are subjected to thematic analysis. We allowed them to re-examine the interview recording. Thus, we organized and prepared the collected data for analysis by repeatedly listening the audio recordings of interviews to get an insight of every interview and to make sure that questions were responded. We thus transcribed the recording and read line to line to include each significant statement relevant to the topic according to the patterns of themes. It was to ensure the deep understanding and comprehensive explanation of the data. Similarly, the participants were given pseudonyms (see table below) to keep the identity confidential. Finally, we analyzed and presented the results and concluded the study.

Table 1: Pseudonyms of participants

No.	Teachers' Pseudonyms	No	Parents' Pseudonyms
1	Teacher-A	1	Parent-A
2	Teacher-B	2	Parent-B
3	Teacher-C	3	Parent-C
4	Teacher-D	4	Parent-D
5	Teacher-E	5	Parent-E
6	Teacher-F	6	Parent-F
7	Teacher-G	7	Parent-G
8	Teacher-H	8	Parent-H
9	Teacher-I	9	Parent-I
10	Teacher-J	10	Parent-J

Ethical Consideration

This study carries human subject thus at school level/district level there is no ethical review board to evaluate and provide the ethical approval for research. However, Ethical Institutional Review Board (IRB) of university has provided the approval to conduct this research. The approval can be provided.

Results and Discussion

This study aimed to examine the teachers' and parents' perspectives regarding the school reforms in Balochistan from 2013 to 2020. School reforms have great significance in restructuring the public schools worldwide. As effective school reforms are witnessed in developed countries. It further incapacitated the educational reforms at large scale, thus, the

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

educational system progressed in developed countries. On the other hand, reform in developing countries although brought however remained ineffective in most of the countries including Pakistan. As it is revealed that the school reforms at elementary level have been effective in Pakistan. It is pertinent to mention here that this research in in the context of developing countries i.e., Pakistan where although efforts are made to reform the public schools however failed to restructure the educational institution at elementary level. We extracted different sub themes from the broad themes undertaken for the study. After careful treatment of recording, we have categorically transcribed the narratives of the teachers and parents. Thus, the findings stemming out of transcription is interpreted through thematic analysis as follows.

Distribution of free textbooks at the school level

Distribution of free textbooks in the school level remained one of the priorities under school reforms in Balochistan. As it was aimed to enhance the enrollment rate by providing basic education unanimously to the marginalized children in the region. However, many loopholes in the provision of the free textbooks were expressed by the parents and teachers collectively free textbooks were not provided before the commencement of the annual session. Moreover, students usually received free textbooks late therefore teachers faced problems for day-to-day teaching lessons. Additionally, the distribution of free textbooks was not according to the needs of students and badly affected students' class performance. Similarly, parents were also unhappy with the provision of free textbooks as they witnessed that the books were neither available in school nor market (Drake, 2020; Smyth, 2020). One of the parents said, *"It is difficult to get all the books, set of books, at one time. So, the provision of books is uneven and unavailable to the people"*. Several researchers also assert similar study findings across the world that the problems in the provision of books have been faced by the parents and students (Ihmeideh et al., 2020; Li, Li, Devlieghere, & Vandenbroeck, 2020; Proctor et al., 2020).

The inclusion of free textbooks was a stimulus to promote education and enhance the enrollment rate. Thus, we found that most parents and teachers were unhappy with the provision of free textbooks before the commencement of annual classes. However, free textbooks were not provided according to the need of students. Most of the teachers endorsed the argument of the parents that, *"books are not provided in time so that education of children would not be disturbed"*. The similar nature of findings have also been reported in developing countries (Breidenstein, Krüger, & Roch, 2020; Davy & Cordoba, 2020; Drake, 2020; Erdreich, 2020).

Teachers' training and recruitments

Recruitment of teachers on merit is one of the components where qualified teachers are required to be hired. To further train the newly appointed teachers, teacher training is the essential component to build the capacity of teachers. So, it was added as school reform in Balochistan. Parents and teachers observed that teachers do not possess professional qualifications as they were not provided in-service teacher training either by the Department of Education or any other private education organization. However, most of the teachers were unaware of reforms introduced at the provincial level in Balochistan. Most of the teachers

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

shared experiences as *“teacher training is not unanimously available to the newly recruited teachers moreover the mechanism of training does not even employ to rest of the teachers”*. One of the teachers highlighted the political influence in such a way, *“all those who politically influence in the department are given training and in almost every training they get nominated while leaving no room for newly recruited teachers”*. Regarding the transparent recruitment policy, they were satisfied and appreciated the measures taken in recruiting the new teachers. As far as the salary packages are concerned, teachers were found dissatisfied with the salary packages they offered (Mankki et al., 2020; Oliemat et al., 2020; Stunell, 2020). It is worth mentioning that our findings are similar to the several research works conducted in the developing and developed countries in terms of teachers' training and recruitment procedures (Rushton & Reiss, 2020; Schachter et al., 2020; Sheppard et al., 2020; Slabbert & Naudé, 2020).

Professional qualification is the backbone of any discipline (Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Muckenthaler et al., 2020). Concerning the teachers' professional qualifications, most of the teachers were found less qualified. Similarly, teachers were disappointed in the poor implementation of teacher training and awareness programs regarding educational reforms. On the other hand, most parents and teachers were contented with the trend of meritocracy in recruitments. Most of the respondents agreed that *“Newly recruited teachers are less likely qualified according to the professional requirements”*. Similar findings were also reported by Farooqi and Forbes (2020) revealing the lack of professional qualifications and training among the newly appointed teachers in Pakistan.

Cooperation between teachers and parents

The involvement of teachers and parents in policy-making has been a salient feature in the reform process the world over (Jabar, 2020) however the teachers and parents were kept out of the realm of reforms process at the school level in Balochistan. We found that parents do not know about the school reforms initiated by the government and alienated them intentionally while teachers-parents council or school management committees were not established to proceed with the discussions of teachers and parents regarding the issues of the education. However, negligence on the part of parents is also observed as most of the parents neither inquired about the performance of children nor interested in school reforms. Moreover, parents do not motivate children towards the significance of education and found less cooperative with teachers to resolve the issue of dropout rate at the school level (Mughal, 2020). Similarly, parents and teachers lack cooperation for the educational development of children. Most of the respondents agreed that *“Negligence is found on both ends of teachers and parents where education of children is nevertheless monitored by both stakeholders. Likewise, there is no system of school management teachers' committees (SMC) for the interaction of parents and teachers to discuss the performance of the children”*. Several studies across the globe revealed that parents' and teachers' interaction and involvement significantly affect the student learning outcomes (Lopes & Oliveira, 2020; Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Stunell, 2020; Wills, 2020). As parents' teachers' cooperation is a compulsory element of educational development worldwide (Li et al., 2020). It is thus concluded that parents were not aware of reforms and do not cooperate with teachers. Furthermore, teachers were also worried about the lack of interest in a childhood education as indicated by different

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

researches (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020).

Teachers' capacity at the school level

It is a significant fact that enhancing the teachers' capacity is necessary to introduce the educational reforms at the school level (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020). The opinion on the phenomenon was inquired from parents and teachers. All the participants identified the shortage and saturation of teaching staff at the school level depending upon the rural-urban segregation. Moreover, teachers do not strategize to facilitate students' learning. Furthermore, the implementation of reforms is dependent on the availability of qualified teaching staff, but the province is mainly experiencing a shortage of staff [both teaching and administrative staff] by and large. Therefore, parents and teachers explained issues that build the capacities of teachers will be a milestone in the promotion and implementation of reforms at the school level. All the participants explained, "*Professional capacity of teachers should be enhanced to take the responsibilities and improve the learning of the students to perform efficiently*". Similarly, different studies revealed that the capacity of teachers significantly matters in terms of students' academic performance (Knight, 2020; Lopes & Oliveira, 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020). It is obvious that competent teachers deliver more and try to develop a friendly learning environment for students as reported by several researchers (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Stavrou, 2020; Stunell, 2020).

Teachers' capacity building plays a vital role in the promotion of quality education (Lopes & Oliveira, 2020). We found parents and teachers dissatisfied due to the shortage of qualified teachers. As the existing staff is overloaded and the promotion of education is an uphill task in such a situation. Moreover, teachers do not strategize to guide students properly (Farooqi & Forbes, 2020). Consequently, the academic performance of students suffers from tertiary level education (Muckenthaler et al., 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020; Stavrou, 2020). Most of the participants explained, "*Government should take measures to provide staff to improve the learning of the students*".

The working environment for teachers

Globally, a conducive working environment for teachers has also been the focus of educational reforms generally in education and particularly at the school level (Su et al., 2020). In this regard, parents and teachers demonstrated that the socio-cultural environment has always been a bottleneck in introducing reforms. Parents shared their experiences that the current environment is not helpful for educational reforms to empower society however teachers believed that the current working environment is better to initiate the reforms. Both the stakeholders have a different view of introducing the educational reforms. All the parents were of the view, "*Presently the environment is not conducive for the education reforms while teachers are in the favor of reforms*". It has also been found in the developing world that a proper work environment is not provided to teachers for class preparation and student guidance (Knight, 2020; Lazareva & Zakharov, 2020; Li et al., 2020; Stunell, 2020). Resultantly, it affected the performance of students in schools (Muckenthaler et al., 2020).

Worldwide, a better working environment paves the way for the implementation of reforms (Paredes-Chi & Viga-de Alva, 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020). We found that parents and teachers could not find a better environment to initiate reforms in society. While parents and

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

teachers are concerned to promote a better learning environment for students in schools (Amod, 2020). As the environment is not teacher-student friendly. Thus, a conducive teaching and learning environment is significant for students' academic performance and education reforms (Slabbert & Naudé, 2020; Stunell, 2020) that may be helpful at a higher level of studies (Li et al., 2020; Wills, 2020).

Provision of infrastructure

The provision of infrastructure has been the backbone of any institution the world over (Roberts & King, 2020). We found that infrastructure plays an important role in the introduction of educational reforms at the school level as a stimulus to increase enrollment ratio. It has been observed by the Parents that the infrastructure of schools was neither constructed nor renovated. However, the repair of old classrooms was not heeded. Furthermore, parents and teachers shared that boundary walls, water supply, gas provision, electricity supply, furniture, and teaching material has been mainly found missing in most of the schools. Therefore, reforms were not very effective at the school level. Most of the participants said, *"There is a need to improve the infrastructure in most of the schools while providing the other facilities to promote the education in schools"*. In Pakistan, several studies highlight that public sector schools are mainly deprived of proper physical infrastructure (Chen & Teo, 2020; Farooqi & Forbes, 2020; Hautz, 2020). Moreover, it is also noted that teachers and students both have improper seating arrangements in terms of infrastructure. Consequently, parents prefer to send their children to private schools. However, the cost of private school also matters for parents specifically in Balochistan. Thus, lack of physical infrastructure in public sector schools also adds to the problems not only for students but also for teachers and students generally in developing countries and specifically in Pakistan (Mughal, 2020).

The provision of proper infrastructure in schools is still a dream for many developing countries (Puad & Ashton, 2020), including Pakistan (Khan et al., 2020). One of the participants said, *"Schooling infrastructure is nevertheless priority of the authorities that significantly affects the reforms where children do not have the proper place to sit and study while teaching aids are missing in most of the schools"*. Similarly, all the parents showed dissatisfaction with the provision of infrastructures such as rooms, water, electricity, gas, furniture, and teaching material or library. All the participants said, *"There is an uneven distribution in the provision of cluster fund however the utilization by schools is also found inappropriate"*. Additionally, the lack of facilities is mainly contributing to high dropout and low enrollment in the region (Mughal, 2020). Consequently, a low literacy rate has been found as compared to other regions stemming from chain reaction i.e., poverty, conflicts, and lack of awareness (McMullen & Eaton, 2020; Puad & Ashton, 2020).

Monitoring and evaluation system at the school level

Globally, every institution has its monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system to monitor and measure the performance and sway the loopholes to sharpen the working capacity of teachers and administrative staff (Qazi, 2020). Similarly, a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system exists in the educational system however remained nonfunctional in Pakistan. Keeping in view educational reforms, only teachers were inquired regarding the monitoring

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

and evaluation system. Most of the participants said, “M&E is good for teachers’ and students’ attendance maintenance and performance and take measures to sway the ambiguities”. However, keeping and checking records were found obscured while corporal punishment is prevalent in most of the schools resulting in less effectiveness of reforms. Moreover, the authorities did not provide enough resources to meet modern challenges according to the changing landscapes of society. As few studies highlighted the ghost schools in a different part of Pakistan particularly in Balochistan. Similarly, parents and teachers are frustrated due to ill monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. It consequently affects the performance and learning of students. Likewise, some teachers are less interested to teach students rather make their ends. In some cases, the attendance of teachers and students has also been questioned (Elacqua et al., 2020; Gleeson et al., 2020). Thus, the examination results were affected due to inadequate mechanisms implemented in reforms (Romans, Wills, Huffman, & Garrison-Kane, 2020; You, 2020).

Monitoring and evaluation is an effective component for keeping attendance record of teachers and students in schools (Mughal, 2020) and identifying the ambiguities and taking radical measures to address the issues. Therefore, teachers expressed disagreement with the transparency of monitoring and evaluation and restrictions on the punishment of students. Similar findings have been reported across the globe (Gleeson et al., 2020; Romans et al., 2020).

Curriculum development at the school level

It has been found that every country develops its curriculum according to the socio-cultural milieu of the country (Roberts & King, 2020). As the parents and teachers expressed that the curriculum was not designed according to the social and cultural makeup of the society. However, it does not meet the standards of modern education in creative abilities, skills, learning, and knowledge. In the nutshell, it was observed that both parents and teachers were dissatisfied with the curriculum. Designing the curriculum according to the aspiration of the people is more helpful for the attainment of knowledge and skills (You, 2020). All the participants agreed, “*Curriculum development is not up to the mark and does not satisfy the needs of changing modern landscapes of society*”. Moreover, it is not designed according to the socio-cultural environment of the region. It is worth mentioning to state that the curriculum of schools develops public opinion, ideologies, and patriotism of the nation (Byrne & Prendergast, 2020). In Pakistan and several other developing nations, lack of infrastructure and funding issues (Gleeson et al., 2020), curriculum design and reforms are major concerns to change the education system (Eli et al., 2020). Thus, the developed world imposes sanctions and strict conditions on developing countries to receive funding (Zhao, 2020) and influence curriculum development as well (Jang, 2020).

Discussion

The research revealed different findings that further need to be anticipated with reference to the literature and findings cited so far from the developed and developing and particular in the context of Pakistan. As long as the reforms in Balochistan are concerned, the books were provided free of cost to the students at elementary level however without addressing other elements of the reform policies it remained ineffective. This shows that without addressing

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

all the interrelated factors provision of the free books was useless. Similar findings are reported by the researcher from India and Sri Lanka indicating that in reform process all the necessary elements need to be integrated for the effective execution of the reform policies. At the same time, research from Iran unveiled that reform policies in education need to be implemented by its spirit. As considerable outcomes have been achieved by Iran in reforming public schools. On the other hand, most of the African countries have failed in getting the educational reform goals so far. As it is reported that this failure is due to the ignorance of necessary measures that are needed to execute the school reforms.

Another most important element of school reform is transparent recruitment of teachers and their training. The developed nations have a transparent procedure of recruiting the teachers and then training them so that they could teach and handle the students to their best. We found that there is transparent procedure of recruiting the teachers in Balochistan. Most of the teachers are appointed on the political basis. The teachers are not trained as there is criteria of recruiting teachers having a degree of Bachelor in Education (B.Ed.) and this degree is mostly achieved either from distance learning or privately. Thus, there exist gap of not being trained as students are properly trained in the regular degree program. It has been found that training of teacher program exist however all the teachers are not provided training after the recruitment. It is also found that relevant officers depute their near and dear ones on training even though they are not newly recruited. Due to these factors, the capacity of teachers at school is low thus they are unable to produce the quality education. In addition, those teachers who are capable or have competency to work do not find friendly environment for teaching at schools. So, it is concluded that without training program teaching cannot be effective in Balochistan, Pakistan. Similar issues have been faced by the other developing countries i.e., India, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh, and Iran. It is revealed that effective reform policies regarding the training of teachers/working environment and quality teaching exist there however the implementation is ineffective. Moreover, this element is also found weak in different African countries by various researchers.

In the integration of school reform policies, cooperation between parents and teachers is also an important factor that leads to effective education system. We found that there is gap between teachers and parents. It is either teachers do not intimate performance of the students or parents do not take interest in education of their children. Without cooperation of teachers and parents the performance of the students cannot be monitored. In every school reform policy there is a major clause of teacher's parents' cooperation however it always remained ineffective. Similar problems have been faced in India as Farooq (2020) indicated that there is lack of cooperation between teachers and parents. Likewise, issues have been faced in Bangladesh, Iran and Gulf countries. On the other hand, in African countries, although the school reform policies are intact while cooperation less likely exist between teachers and parents to examine the performance of the students.

Research shows that the infrastructure has been issue in the educational structure of school reforms. In case of Pakistan, it has been one of the big challenges for the reformers/government to provide the proper infrastructure to the elementary schools. As we also found infrastructure as one of the key hurdles in the school reforms. Most of the schools have either old building and with zero amenities required for the school education. Although the land is available however the infrastructure has never been priority of the authorities. This situation

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

is worse in rural areas of Balochistan. India, Iran, and Sri Lanka have similar issues of infrastructure where school exists without proper building. Likewise, the African countries also face problems of infrastructure.

Monitoring and evaluation of the schools is one of the important factors that keeps an eye on the smoothness of whole system. This process is necessary to know the conditions of schools, infrastructure, and teaching staff. On the other hand, transparent evaluation is the key element to enhance the capacity of the institutions. We found that monitoring and evaluation is limited to the policy document. Although a comprehensive process is documented however it has never been implemented on ground. Moreover, the monitoring and evaluation system is confined to the offices. In most of the developing countries, monitoring and evaluation process is very poor. As Farooq (2020) revealed that monitoring system of schools in India is poorer and even the schools are never visited by the authorities. Similarly, Farooq (2020) found that monitoring and evaluation system of schools in Sri Lanka is also poor and need further reforms. In Iran, monitoring and evaluation system is also not up to the mark. Moreover, the monitoring and evaluation system in African developing countries is also need different immediate reforms as highlighted by many researchers.

The curriculum development has its significance in education, and it is normally carried out by a separate wing of review syllabus. However, there is less engagement of the schoolteachers in curriculum development. As the teachers are basic elements who know the problems faced by them during teaching coupled with other structural issues. We found that the teachers never participate in the curriculum development that in fact left behind the loopholes in the school reforms. As the teachers must be involved at least they should be inquired about the problems they faced. Thus, it is concluded that the teachers are not part of the curriculum development in Balochistan. Similar issues are faced by the teachers in India and Sri Lanka. Moreover, the teachers in Gulf and African countries are also kept away from the curriculum development process.

Conclusion

Based on the study findings, we conclude that the well-designed and executed reforms are the soul of any institution and particularly in educational institutions. Unfortunately, Balochistan has a long history of multifaceted marginalization in different social aspects generally and particularly in education. Previously, the government took the initiative to bring reforms to develop and restructure the educational institutions at the school level. Despite reforms, situations in schools are still at the mercy of poor administration. However, it has failed to execute the school reforms in the region. Moreover, authorities failed to resurrect poor infrastructure with a shortage of staff, ill M&E system, improper training mechanism, and provision of free books. It is recommended that school reforms should be executed by providing free textbooks, teacher training, and capacity building, revisiting the medium of instruction, improving the infrastructure and curriculum development along with the monitoring and evaluation system. Thus, the study further suggests that the educational reforms should be properly implemented to promote literacy in Balochistan.

References

1. Amod, Z. (2020). A teacher-family consultation approach to school-based intervention and

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

-
- support. *International Journal of Disability, Development and Education*, Vol? Issue?1-15. doi:10.1080/1034912X.2020.1749238
2. Breidenstein, G., Krüger, J. O., & Roch, A. (2020). Parents as 'customers'? The perspective of the 'providers' of school education. A case study from Germany. *Comparative education*, 56(3), 409-422. doi:10.1080/03050068.2020.1724485
 3. Byrne, C., & Prendergast, M. (2020). Investigating the concerns of secondary school teachers towards curriculum reform. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 52(2), 286-306. doi:10.1080/00220272.2019.1643924
 4. Chen, J., & Teo, T. (2020). Chinese school teachers' conceptions of high-stakes and low-stakes assessments: an invariance analysis. *Educational Studies*, 46(4), 458-475. doi:10.1080/03055698.2019.1599823
 5. Davy, Z., & Cordoba, S. (2020). School Cultures and Trans and Gender-diverse Children: Parents' Perspectives. *Journal of GLBT Family Studies*, 16(4), 349-367. doi:10.1080/1550428X.2019.1647810
 6. Drake, C. J. (2020). Parent perceptions of school/teacher effectiveness with Punjabi-Sikh students and their families. *Sikh Formations*, 1-24. doi:10.1080/17448727.2020.1741180
 7. Education, F. M. o. (2018). *Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-2017*. Retrieved from Islamabad
 8. Elacqua, G. M., Sánchez, F., & Santos, H. A. (2020). School reorganization reforms: the case of multi-site schools in Colombia. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 1-32. doi:10.1080/09243453.2020.1797830
 9. Eli, Munkebye, Scheie, E., Gabrielsen, A., Jordet, A., Misund, S., . . . Øyehaug, A. B. (2020). Interdisciplinary primary school curriculum units for sustainable development. *Environmental Education Research*, 26(6), 795-811. doi:10.1080/13504622.2020.1750568
 10. Erdreich, L. (2020). Mediating intimacy: parent-teacher digital communication and perceptions of 'proper intimacy' among early childhood educators. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*, 1-21. doi:10.1080/09620214.2020.1807387
 11. Farooqi, S., & Forbes, T. (2020). Enacted discretion: policy implementation, local government reform and education services in Pakistan. *Public Management Review*, 22(8), 1217-1239. doi:10.1080/14719037.2019.1630134
 12. Gleeson, J., Klenowski, V., & Looney, A. (2020). Curriculum change in Australia and Ireland: a comparative study of recent reforms. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 52(4), 478-497. doi:10.1080/00220272.2019.1704064
 13. Hautz, H. (2020). The 'conduct of conduct' of VET teachers: governmentality and teacher professionalism. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 1-18. doi:10.1080/13636820.2020.1754278
 14. Henderson, L. J., Williams, J. L., & Bradshaw, C. P. (2020). Examining home-school dissonance as a barrier to parental involvement in middle school. *Preventing School Failure: Alternative Education for Children and Youth*, 64(3), 201-211. doi:10.1080/1045988X.2020.1719964
 15. Ihmeideh, F., AlFlasi, M., Al-Maadadi, F., Coughlin, C., & Al-Thani, T. (2020). Perspectives of family-school relationships in Qatar based on Epstein's model of six types of parent involvement. *Early Years*, 40(2), 188-204. doi:10.1080/09575146.2018.1438374
 16. Jabar, M. A. (2020). Qualitative inquiry on parental involvement in children's education: perspectives of parents, children, and teachers in select elementary schools in the Philippines. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 1-15. doi:10.1080/02188791.2020.1806035
 17. Jabeen, F. (2020). The perpetuation of colonial legacy: uncovering internal orientalism in the form of English supremacy in Pakistan. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 41(5), 432-443. doi:10.1080/01434632.2019.1653303
 18. Jang, S. B. (2020). Legitimising the need for another curriculum reform and policy framing: the case of South Korea. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 52(2), 247-269.

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

-
- doi:10.1080/00220272.2019.1657955
19. Ju, Y., & Liu, J. (2020). Mechanisms of the tailoring workshops for teacher sustainable development: A case study of a middle school in Shanghai1. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 1-15. doi:10.1080/00131857.2020.1794275
 20. Karacabey, M. F., Bellibaş, M. Ş., & Adams, D. (2020). Principal leadership and teacher professional learning in Turkish schools: examining the mediating effects of collective teacher efficacy and teacher trust. *Educational Studies*, 1-20. doi:10.1080/03055698.2020.1749835
 21. Kauppinen, M., Kainulainen, J., Hökkä, P., & Vähäsantanen, K. (2020). Professional agency and its features in supporting teachers' learning during an in-service education programme. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 43(3), 384-404. doi:10.1080/02619768.2020.1746264
 22. Khan, F. Z. A., Manzoor, S. A., Akmal, M., Imran, M. U., Taqi, M., Manzoor, S. A., . . . Joseph, S. V. (2020). Modeling pesticide use intention in Pakistani farmers using expanded versions of the theory of planned behavior. *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment: An International Journal*, 1-21. doi:10.1080/10807039.2020.1750345
 23. Knight, R. (2020). The tensions of innovation: experiences of teachers during a whole school pedagogical shift. *Research Papers in Education*, 35(2), 205-227. doi:10.1080/02671522.2019.1568527
 24. Lazareva, O., & Zakharov, A. (2020). Teacher wages and educational outcomes: evidence from the Russian school system. *Education Economics*, 28(4), 418-436. doi:10.1080/09645292.2020.1775181
 25. Li, Y., Li, J., Devlieghere, J., & Vandenberg, M. (2020). What parents and teachers say about their relationships in ECEC: a study in rural China. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, 28(3), 332-348. doi:10.1080/1350293X.2020.1755489
 26. Lopes, J., & Oliveira, C. (2020). Teacher and school determinants of teacher job satisfaction: a multilevel analysis. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 1-19. doi:10.1080/09243453.2020.1764593
 27. Mankki, V., Mäkinen, M., & Rähkä, P. (2020). Teacher educators' predictability and student selection paradigms in entrance examinations for the Finnish Primary School Teacher Education programme. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 43(2), 151-164. doi:10.1080/02619768.2019.1672653
 28. Marklund, E. (2020). Who was going to become a teacher? The socio-economic background of primary school teachers in northern Sweden 1870–1950. *History of Education*, 1-23. doi:10.1080/0046760X.2020.1760946
 29. Masbirroti, M., Mukminin, A., Habibi, A., Haryanto, E., Hidayat, M., Marzulina, L., . . . Kamil, D. (2020). Why Student Teachers Major in English Education: An Analysis of Motives for Becoming Future Teachers. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 13(4), 429-452.
 30. McGarr, O., & Ó Gallchóir, C. (2020). Exploring pre-service teachers' justifications for one-to-one technology use in schools: implications for initial teacher education. *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, 29(4), 477-490. doi:10.1080/1475939X.2020.1784261
 31. McMullen, J., & Eaton, P. (2020). The impact of a school-based life skills intervention in Ugandan secondary schools: perspectives of teachers and students. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 1-20. doi:10.1080/02643944.2020.1751687
 32. Muckenthaler, M., Tillmann, T., Weiß, S., & Kiel, E. (2020). Teacher collaboration as a core objective of school development. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 31(3), 486-504. doi:10.1080/09243453.2020.1747501
 33. Mughal, A. W. (2020). Secondary school students who drop out of school in rural Pakistan: The perspectives of fathers. *Educational Research*, 62(2), 199-215. doi:10.1080/00131881.2020.1755604
 34. Oliemat, A., Al-Zboon, E., & Al-Dababneh, K. (2020). The importance of and barriers to using a

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

-
- reading pictures strategy in the kindergarten curriculum: Jordanian teachers' perspectives. *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 1-11. doi:10.1080/09669760.2020.1779670
35. Paredes-Chi, A., & Viga-de Alva, M. D. (2020). Participatory action research (PAR) and environmental education (EE): A Mexican experience with teachers from a primary rural school. *Environmental Education Research*, 1-16. doi:10.1080/13504622.2020.1788515
36. Proctor, H., Roch, A., Breidenstein, G., & Forsey, M. (2020). Parents, schools and the twenty-first-century state: comparative perspectives. *Comparative education*, 56(3), 317-330. doi:10.1080/03050068.2020.1781422
37. Puad, L. M. A. Z., & Ashton, K. (2020). Teachers' views on classroom-based assessment: an exploratory study at an Islamic boarding school in Indonesia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 1-13. doi:10.1080/02188791.2020.1761775
38. Qazi, M. H. (2020). Exploring links between national education and students' militaristic national identity constructions – a case study of Pakistani state schools in Islamabad. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 52(4), 516-532. doi:10.1080/00220272.2020.1755997
39. Roberts, F., & King, P. (2020). School leaders' perspectives of Welsh education reform. *Education 3-13*, 1-14. doi:10.1080/03004279.2020.1760330
40. Romans, S. K., Wills, H. P., Huffman, J. M., & Garrison-Kane, L. (2020). The effect of web-based self-monitoring to increase on-task behavior and academic accuracy of high school students with autism. *Preventing School Failure: Alternative Education for Children and Youth*, 64(3), 249-260. doi:10.1080/1045988X.2020.1732282
41. Rushton, E. A. C., & Reiss, M. J. (2020). Middle and high school science teacher identity considered through the lens of the social identity approach: a systematic review of the literature. *Studies in Science Education*, 1-63. doi:10.1080/03057267.2020.1799621
42. Schachter, R. E., Flynn, E. E., Napoli, A. R., & Piasta, S. B. (2020). Teachers' Perspectives on Year Two Implementation of a Kindergarten Readiness Assessment. *Early Education and Development*, 31(5), 778-795. doi:10.1080/10409289.2019.1679606
43. Sheppard, M., Wolfinger, M. E., & Talbert, R. (2020). Leading from the start: preservice teachers' conceptions of teacher leadership. *Teaching Education*, 1-17. doi:10.1080/10476210.2020.1772226
44. Slabbert, C., & Naudé, L. (2020). School as a "stage of life": approaches to diversity among teachers in racially-integrated schools. *Educational Studies*, 1-13. doi:10.1080/03055698.2020.1740878
45. Smits, T. F. H., & Janssenswillen, P. (2020). Multicultural teacher education: a cross-case exploration of pre-service language teachers' approach to ethnic diversity. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 33(4), 421-445. doi:10.1080/09518398.2019.1681536
46. Smyth, E. (2020). Shaping educational expectations: the perspectives of 13-year-olds and their parents. *Educational Review*, 72(2), 173-195. doi:10.1080/00131911.2018.1492518
47. Stavrou, N. E. (2020). Looking at the ideal secondary school music teacher in Cyprus: teachers' and students' perspectives. *Music Education Research*, 22(3), 346-359. doi:10.1080/14613808.2020.1762556
48. Stunell, K. (2020). Supporting student-teachers in the multicultural classroom. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 1-17. doi:10.1080/02619768.2020.1758660
49. Su, X., Guo, J., & Wang, X. (2020). Different stakeholders' perspectives on inclusive education in China: parents of children with ASD, parents of typically developing children, and classroom teachers. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 24(9), 948-963. doi:10.1080/13603116.2018.1502367
50. Szeto, E., Sin, K., & Leung, G. (2020). A cross-school PLC: how could teacher professional development of robot-based pedagogies for all students build a social-justice school? *Professional Development in Education*, 1-15. doi:10.1080/19415257.2020.1787201
51. Tripathi, D., & Raghuvanshi, V. (2020). Portraying the "Other" in Textbooks and Movies: The
-

A Qualitative Inquiry into School Reforms in Balochistan (2013 to 2020): ...

- Mental Borders and Their Implications for India–Pakistan Relations. *Journal of Borderlands Studies*, 35(2), 195-210. doi:10.1080/08865655.2019.1646151
52. Wills, G. (2020). Teachers' unions and industrial action in South African primary schools: Exploring their impacts on learning. *Development Southern Africa*, 37(2), 328-347. doi:10.1080/0376835X.2019.1682969
53. Xiong, Z., Warwick, I., & Chalies, S. (2020). Understanding novice teachers' perspectives on China's sexuality education: a study based on the national pre-service teacher education programme. *Sex Education*, 20(3), 252-266. doi:10.1080/14681811.2019.1640113
54. You, Y. (2020). Run by others: school autonomy in Shanghai's entrustment management reform. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 1-15. doi:10.1080/02188791.2020.1772198
55. Yuen, M., Lee, Q. A. Y., & Chung, Y. B. (2020). Meaning in life, connectedness, and life skills development in junior secondary school students: teachers' perspectives in Hong Kong. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 1-17. doi:10.1080/02643944.2020.1774634
56. Zhao, W. (2020). Problematizing "epistemicide" in transnational curriculum knowledge production: China's suyang curriculum reform as an example. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 50(2), 105-125. doi:10.1080/03626784.2020.1736521