

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province: An Application of Moral Foundation Theory

Narjis Unar

PhD Scholar, Department of Education Institute of Business Management Karachi, Pakistan.

Email nnarjisunar@yahoo.com

Prof. Dr. Nasreen Hussain

Advisor to President, Institute of Business management Karachi, Pakistan.

Email nasreen.hussain@iobm.edu.pk

Received on: 10-10-2021

Accepted on: 12-11-2021

Abstract

The paper investigated the effectiveness of the implemented curriculum in emphasizing the moral values of students in primary public sector schools in Sindh. Also it analyzes the role played by the school principals/head teachers in promoting moral values among students. The paper also explored how teachers at primary schools contribute to developing the moral values of students. The study has collected 177 responses from the teachers of primary public level schools of five districts of Sindh province using purposive sampling technique while PLS-SEM has been employed for data analysis using SmartPLS v3.2.9. The results have shown that effectiveness of curriculum, teachers' implicit beliefs, and role of principals have positive effect on students' moral development while teachers' implicit beliefs and role of principals have positive effect on role of teachers; whereas, teachers' implicit beliefs and role of principals have positive effect on effectiveness of curriculum. The mediation analysis showed that effectiveness of curriculum has positive mediation between teachers' implicit beliefs and role of principals towards students' moral development. However, socioeconomic support has no significant moderating effect on the role of curriculum effectiveness, teachers' and principals' role towards students' moral development. In this regards, it has been recommended that schools can best promote students' moral growth by assisting instructors in coping with the difficulties of their jobs and developing teachers' capacity for introspection and empathy. Students undoubtedly benefit from community service, being reminded of essential qualities, and developing good habits.

Keywords: Students' Moral Development, Role of Principals, Curriculum Effectiveness, Public Primary Schools, Sindh.

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

1. Introduction

One may not begin to analyze what moral values are without first understanding the morality and importance of moral education (ME) (Kristjánsson, 2020). Morality is a system of principles and values concerning people's behavior, which is generally accepted by a society or by a particular group of people (Asif et al., 2020). Uwaezuoke (2020) vouches that morality develops a sense of judging right or wrong and this in turn, develops a sense to boost one's morale, which affects each other.

Moral values are relative values, which protect life and respect the dual value of self and others as taught at primary school level in Moral Education (ME), which plays an essential role in student's personality (Farisia, 2020). This may be considered as advancement and a step forward for progress of a nation because at primary school level, learning is at its maximum when children are in their developmental stage (Ghorai et al., 2021). Moreover, nonetheless, certain research in the context of moral domain theory support the idea that disparities in socioeconomic situations and cultural background might influence how people judge rule breaches, including moral rule violations. Also, crucial aspects are taught through assignments, everyday experiences, cooperative activities, in an effective curriculum. Everyone understands and agrees on the objectives (Nishanbayeva et al., 2021). And, if a parent wants his or her child to grow up to be a responsible adult, moral education can assist in that goal. Moral education must be a part of an effective curriculum that teaches kids how to take on minor obligations in order to develop this crucial ability (Farisia, 2020).

IQBAL (2015) reiterates that Pakistan being an Islamic state, focuses on inculcating moral values and deliberate efforts have been seen so far. The National Education Policy of Pakistan (NEP, 2009) implements programs and activities effectively for the comprehensive personality development of children and the same has been stressed in the National Educational Policy of Pakistan (NEP, 2017). Shamshiri (2017) confirms that policymakers are adopting several strategies and procedures to increase the quality and quantity of education services offered by public schools. According to the Sector Evaluation Report on School Education (June 2019) released by the Asian Development Bank, Pakistan's budget is just 2% of its gross national product on education, which it is a far smaller proportion than in comparison with other countries of the world (Amir et al., 2020).

Naseer et al. (2020) assures that there is no tradition of critical thinking and problem-based classroom teaching in Pakistan. Teachers continue using the conventional methods, which leads to rote learning and the actual knowledge gets lost on the way. They provide topics for forthcoming lessons to be practiced by learners at home and select few learners for class discussions, which is the only activity included and shown in the lesson plan (Siddiqui & Habib, 2021). Moreover, reasonable people can make bad judgments; it is often not easy to know what is morally right. The second task of ME (Moral Education) is to provide students with intellectual resources that will allow them to make educated and responsible decisions on thorny moral issues (Siddiqui & Habib, 2021). The National Educational Policy of Pakistan focuses attention on two significant and essential issues facing the sector: (1) low participation and a narrow base; and (2) poor quality of service (Ahmed & Khan, 2020). Khan et al. (2020) addressed that the inability of the country's public and private schools to teach moral virtues is also the foremost cause of these difficulties. It leads to problems that emerge due to the non-existence of ME, which leads to low morale. No research has been conducted

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

in Pakistan, as per our knowledge, that has worked on the present topic considering morality development in students as a dependent variable and socio-economic conditions as a moderator.

By taking into consideration these problems, the following research objectives are framed: firstly, the paper investigated the effectiveness of the implemented curriculum in emphasizing the moral values of students in primary public sector schools in Sindh. Also it analyzes the role played by the school principals/head teachers in promoting moral values among students. The paper also explored how teachers at primary public level schools in Sindh contribute to developing the moral values of students. This study will be beneficial for students, parents, school milieu, the community and policymakers as well. It gives proactive insight to the researchers, government, policy makers, analysts, and educationists regarding how the curriculum can be implemented in schools that could result in the moral development of the students. Furthermore, they would understand how different and important factors act in the organizations to enhance morality development in students, in a developing nation that is Islamic republic of Pakistan in this study and particularly in the Sindh province. This study has a great significance in order to find out the factors through which the policy makers and the management of the schools improve and develops a curriculum that can be beneficial for both the teachers and students in terms of their growth and moral development and on the other side it is significant in making the organization achieve its overall targets and future missions.

2. Literature review

2.1. Underpinning theory

Several theories of ME have been searched for this research study, among which the Moral foundation theory (MFT) about morality and cross-cultural research on virtues Haidt and Joseph (2004) has been found the best fit. ME is central to the school's goal. In practical education, moral philosophy, psychology and education are inseparable (Han, 2014).

MFT was first proposed in 2004 by Haidt and Joseph. The theory was first developed from a simultaneous review of current evolutionary thinking about morality and cross-cultural research on virtues (Haidt & Joseph, 2004). Moral foundations theory is a social psychology theory that uses intrinsic, modular underpinnings to explain the origins of and variety in human moral thinking. The theory suggests six foundations: Care/Harm, Fairness/Cheating, Loyalty/Betrayal, Authority/Subversion, Sanctity/Degradation, and Liberty/Oppression (Faas et al., 2018). These suggested six foundations are perfectly matched with selected moral elements: justice, truthfulness, patience, kindness, respect and empathy of the study.

In the context of MFT, when students leave school, an appropriate school ethics program and an effective curriculum can provide opportunities for them to exercise moral practices develop thinking skills, acquire a profound knowledge of moral philosophy (Pijanowski et al., 2009). Furthermore, teaching is a morally upright occupation. It is a calling that necessitates both a strong personal commitment and the application of simple, logical values. Education in many countries is designed to promote the overall growth of the individual rather than just the cognitive realm (Rissanen et al., 2018). Also, as per the theory, the school principal is a moral entity in that she or he acts on behalf of a larger group of people: the students, their guardians, the state (justice, social welfare, education, and health), the government, and the

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

educational authority that employs them (Cherkowski et al., 2020). Moral domain theory supports the idea that variations in socioeconomic circumstances and cultural background may influence how people judge rule transgressions, including moral rule violations (Bizzo & Caravita, 2012). According to MFT, from infancy to maturity, moral growth is concerned with the appearance, improvement, and interpretation of morality (Narvaez, 2021).

2.2. Development of the hypotheses

According to Bussey and Hill (2017) a curriculum is effective if it will work in conjunction with teachers' abilities to improve teacher effectiveness, assist students in gaining learning opportunities that are tailored to their needs, morality development in students, and achieve the desired instructional outcomes, under the pre-existing characteristics such as national priorities, school goals, school administration, subject matter, instructional technology, and tools. Whereas, morality develops as a result of the teaching of certain beliefs, behaviors, and dispositions in order to promote students' pro - social and moral development through the curriculum or other activities (Farsakhanova, 2020). Most authors like Julia et al. (2020) believe that discourse and cooperation are critical for students' positive behavioral and moral development. Therefore, we propose:

H1. Effectiveness of the curriculum has a positive effect on students' morality development.

Teachers instill moral values and attitudes in students and serve as role models by demonstrating desirable characteristics in the classroom and community (Omar, 2018). Additionally, the instructor constructs an atmosphere in which students are successfully exposed to the various points of view reflected by the various levels of moral reasoning in a given classroom. Self-reflection and dialogue lead to moral development. It is important to provide an environment conducive to self-disclosure and this can only be done through responsible and effective teachers (Gunawan et al., 2017). The teacher's role in moral education is to give students the ability to arrange their own experiences in more nuanced ways. Educators initiate a developmental process aimed at assisting pupils in pursuing their moral development after their traditional classroom education is completed (Fitria & Suminah, 2020). Therefore, we propose:

H2. Role of teachers has a positive effect on students' morality development.

Moral competence refers to the high level of educators' educational activities, which are judged against professional norms and manifested in educators' moral practices and positions in school life (Kuusisto & Tirri, 2019). Teachers can affect students' motivation and performance by shaping their perceptions of their skills. Schools will better promote students' moral development by assisting teachers in coping with the demands of their jobs and the teachers' capacity for insight and empathy (Hidayah, 2021). Therefore, we propose:

H3. Teachers' implicit beliefs have a positive effect on students' morality development.

Teachers' beliefs influence how they teach, how their students evolve, how they make decisions, and how they communicate with their students (Kim & Seo, 2018). According to Moltudal et al. (2019) teachers must have a positive outlook and a wide range of beliefs. Also, teachers, on the other hand, should instill values by selecting and excluding subjects, insisting on the right responses, encouraging students to seek the facts, establishing classroom schedules, forming classes, enforcing discipline, encouraging competence, and so on. They must behave appropriately, dress, and maintain a positive attitude (Erdogan & Cavli, 2019).

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

It is important to understand that moral values can be taught to students, and by teaching moral values, students can learn what they want, distinguish what is good from what is evil, and fix problems in their lives (Erdogan & Cavli, 2019; Ilaltdinova et al., 2017). Therefore, we propose:

H4. Teachers' implicit beliefs have a positive effect on role of teachers.

H5. Teachers' implicit beliefs have a positive effect on students' morality development with the mediation of the role of teachers.

Sailin and Mahmor (2018) concluded that teachers must first define and explain the principles found in the instruction and pedagogical options they provide in their educational qualifications before they can begin educating pre-service teachers about values. Castillo (2018) suggested that it's important to remember that education degrees still have a complete curriculum and adding 'specialist' units that look at principles and morality will necessitate the elimination of other courses. Pre-service teachers will be able to recognize the ways in which they express their own beliefs, as well as the ways in which they can mold the values and spiritual learning of their future pupils, by shifting their emphasis subtly to make this often "hidden curriculum" visible and a source of dialogue and contemplation (Polat, 2018). Therefore, we propose:

H6. Teachers' implicit beliefs have a positive effect on effectiveness of the curriculum.

H7. Teachers' implicit beliefs have a positive effect on students' morality development with the mediation of effectiveness of the curriculum.

In schools, teaching and guiding is essentially a moral activity (Emambokus, 2021). The role of the school principal as an agent in building and maintaining a moral and ethical environment in the school has been well-founded in literature. Other than their moral conduct, school principals bear the responsibility to create an ethical framework and for the acts of those they are tasked with leading (Shabani Azadboni & Safari, 2020). Gunawan et al. (2020) concluded that nothing can be more effective in shaping a child's moral character than the principal's or teacher's behavior, as has been repeatedly emphasized. The school has a major impact on a child's moral values. Principals might instill different intrinsic values in children by organizing various curricular and co-curricular events (Hidayah, 2021). Therefore, we propose:

H8. Role of principals/head teachers has a positive effect on students' morality development.

Educational leaders make everyday choices that have an impact on others, making their acts morally questionable (Khanam & Idris, 2020). Kavakli and Arslan (2019) concluded that the influence of a leader on the people that he or she mentors highlight the importance of morality, particularly in a self-governing community where leaders must embody and express the common ideals of those they lead. Students, team members, and the institution all profit from school leaders (Kavakli & Arslan, 2019; Shen et al., 2020) Teachers, educators, and partners look up to moral figures. They have guidance and empathy for everyone they lead, so they must connect professionally and efficiently with everyone they lead. Therefore, we propose:

H9. Role of principals/head teachers has a positive effect on role of teachers.

H10. Role of principals/head teachers has a positive effect on students' morality development with the mediation of the role of teachers.

Principals play a critical role in providing high-quality training (Andedo et al., 2021). They

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

are responsible for ensuring the instructional policies that promote effective learning for all students are in operation (Juharyanto et al., 2018; Shen et al., 2020). Via their facilitation, direction, and encouragement of appropriate instructional methods, school principals play an important role in enhancing student achievement (Grissom et al., 2021). Additionally, they should recognize that teamwork is worthwhile and can be effective (Sider et al., 2017). To outline or change the campus' action plan, the principals should begin with a review of evidence and feedback from students, curriculum personnel, and consultants. Therefore, we propose:

H11. Role of principals/head teachers has a positive effect on effectiveness of the curriculum.

H12. Role of principals/head teachers has a positive effect on students' morality development with the mediation of effectiveness of the curriculum.

A good curriculum broadens students' comprehension of the environment and trains them for life in the twenty-first century (Abdolmaleki et al., 2018). It broadens students' horizons and heightens their curiosity (Babadjanova, 2020).

In terms of family wealth, political influence, educational history, and career prestige, socio-economic status (SES) is a term used to distinguish people's relative place in society (Malone, 2017). Teachers' success and the standard of education are influenced by how they carry out their responsibilities (Khotimah et al., 2019). According to von Stumm (2017), children who report high levels of life satisfaction and are in good health have stronger bonds with their teachers, achieve higher marks, and are more dedicated to their studies. It has been noticed that such students come from a higher social status (Pratama & Ridha, 2019). As the governmental, private, and public sectors strive to succeed in the ever-changing twenty-first century, they are looking to the educational system to produce skilled people capable of working in a technologically advanced world (Adejumo, 2017). For the primary purpose of enhancing and maintaining student success, school administrators must be able to handle the academic, organizational, and social facets of the school enterprise, both of which are vastly diverse and nonlinear (Faas et al., 2018; Liebowitz & Porter, 2019). Therefore, we propose:

H13. Favorable socioeconomic support of students significantly moderates the effect of the effectiveness of curriculum on students' morality development.

Social and emotional learning that fosters skills, habits, and mindsets that enable academic progress, efficacy, and productive behavior. These include self-regulation, executive function, intrapersonal awareness and interpersonal skills, a growth mindset, and a sense of agency that supports resilience and productive action; a multi-tiered system of academic, health, and social supports that provide personalized resources within and beyond the classroom to address and prevent developmental detours, including conditions of trauma and adversity (Hammond et al.2020).

H14. Favorable socioeconomic support of students significantly moderates the effect of role of teachers on students' morality development.

Students who perceive their teachers as caring, attentive, fair, and understanding are expected to be more motivated to interact, discuss, and participate in class (Wanders et al., 2020). Positive *teacher-student relationships* cultivate an environment where students can feel safe and are able, and willing to, participate in discussions (Mashburn et al., 2006; Wentzel et al., 2016). There is a view, supported by the pivotal role of the head discussed earlier, that the culture of the school starts with the beliefs and values of the head, and the

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

head then seeks to promote the same values and beliefs in the staff (Nias, 1998).

H15. Favorable socioeconomic support of students significantly moderates the effectiveness of the role of principals/head teachers on students' morality development.

3. Methodology

3.1. Sampling design

The sample size estimation of the quantitative research has been conducted by using the $50+8k$ formula given by Krejcie and Morgan (1970) in which k is the number of variables in the model. This research has six variables and it has to gather at least 98 sample responses. Therefore, the researcher has aimed to gather 177 sample responses from the teachers' of public schools of five districts of Sindh province using purposive sampling technique.

3.2. Respondents' profile

Table 3.1:
Demographic Profile (n = 177)

		Frequency	Percent
Gender	Male	62	35
	Female	115	65
Age Groups	Below 40	45	25.4
	Between 40- 50	62	35
	Between 50-60	70	39.5
Marital status	Married	79	44.6
	Unmarried	98	55.4
Academic Qualification	Bachelors/B.Ed	43	24.3
	Masters/M.Ed.	125	70.6
	Any Other	9	5.1
Teaching/Administration Experience	1-5 five years	18	10.2
	6-10 years	27	15.3
	11-15 years	17	9.6
	16-20 years	9	5.1
	21-25 years	18	10.2
District Location of the School	25 years and above	88	49.7
	Jamshoro	33	18.6
	Khairpur Mir's	36	20.3
	Naushahro Feroze	36	20.3
	Sukkur	36	20.3
	Karachi South	36	20.3

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

4. Results and findings

Structural equation modeling (SEM) has been effectively used in different types of business researches since the use in 1980. The need to examine concepts and theories with a high depth aspect enables researcher to conduct SEM analysis (Hair et al., 2011). SEM has two categories entitled as CB-SEM and PLS-SEM; however, PLS-SEM has been implemented widely for statistical estimations for variance maximization and predictive-orientation (Hair et al., 2012). It is a non-parametric multivariate approach that helps to examine latent variables and their relationships (Avkiran & Ringle, 2018). In addition, PLS-SEM enables analyses for complex relationships/models and comparatively small sample size ($n < 250$). This technique also refereed as a causal modeling approach for accurate mediation and moderation analysis simultaneously (Hair Jr et al., 2014). PLS-SEM also gives predictive relevance of the exogenous constructs using PLS blindfolding technique (Hair et al., 2016). Hence, the study has employed PLS-SEM using SmartPLS 3.2.9 for data analysis comprising (1) measurement model for estimating the relationship between indicators and latent constructs that have theoretical foundations and (2) structural model that refers to the statistical inference for estimating hypothesized relationship between latent constructs.

4.1. Measurement model

In this regards, Hair et al. (2011) suggested that indicator reliability should be higher than 0.70 for substantial extent of representation towards latent constructs while Hair et al. (2016) recommended that Cronbach's alpha should be higher than 0.70, composite reliability (CR) should be higher than 0.80 and average variance extracted (AVE) should be higher than 0.50 for substantial extent of convergence between indicators and latent constructs. The results in table 4.1 showed that measurement model has achieved recommended cut-off values and therefore, theoretical relationship between indicators and latent constructs has been validated statistically.

Table 4.1:

Measurement Model using PLS algorithm

Variables	Items	Loadings	Alpha	CR	AVE
Effectiveness of curriculum	EC1	0.925	0.842	0.927	0.863
	EC4	0.934			
	RP2	0.920			
Role of principals	RP3	0.799	0.863	0.917	0.787
	RP4	0.936			
	RT2	0.899			
Role of teachers	RT3	0.900	0.880	0.926	0.806
	RT4	0.895			
Socioeconomic support	SES2	0.733	0.631	0.829	0.712
	SES3	0.942			
Students' morality development	SMD1	0.896	0.882	0.927	0.810
	SMD2	0.867			

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

	SMD4	0.936			
	TIB2	0.948			
Teachers' implicit beliefs	TIB3	0.864	0.896	0.936	0.829
	TIB4	0.917			

Measurement model also estimates the result of discriminant validity for assessing the existence of divergence between latent constructs that are unrelated in theory (Cheung & Wang, 2017). In this regards, PLS-SEM has conducted discriminant validity using Fornell and Larcker (1981) criterion (FLC) and the result have been presented in table 4.2.

Table 4.2:
Discriminant validity using FLC method

	EC	RP	RT	SES	SMD	TIB
Effectiveness of curriculum	0.929					
Role of principals	0.857	0.887				
Role of teachers	0.872	0.881	0.898			
Socioeconomic support	0.030	0.028	0.059	0.844		
Students' morality development	0.865	0.837	0.838	0.077	0.900	
Teachers' implicit beliefs	0.867	0.853	0.862	0.077	0.874	0.910

Bold diagonal values are the squared-root coefficients of AVE and these bold diagonal values found higher than respective correlation coefficients (non-bold coefficients); therefore discriminant validity using FLC method has been achieved.

4.2. Structural model

Table 4.3 shows the result of hypothesis-testing using PLS-SEM for direct-effect and mediation analysis. The findings of the study has shown that hypothesis-1 has been accepted manifesting that effectiveness of curriculum ($\beta = 0.315$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on students' morality development. Hypothesis-2 has been rejected manifesting that role of teachers ($\beta = 0.094$; $p > 0.05$) has a positive but statistically insignificant effect on students' morality development. Hypothesis-3 has been accepted teachers' implicit beliefs ($\beta = 0.391$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on students' morality development. Hypothesis-4 has been accepted manifesting that teachers' implicit belief ($\beta = 0.405$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on role of teachers. Hypothesis-5 has been rejected manifesting that teachers' implicit belief ($\beta = 0.038$; $p > 0.05$) has a positive but statistically insignificant effect on students' morality development with the mediating role of role of teachers. Hypothesis-6 has been accepted manifesting that teachers' implicit belief ($\beta = 0.497$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on effectiveness of curriculum; likewise, hypothesis-7 has also been accepted manifesting that teachers' implicit belief ($\beta = 0.157$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on students' morality

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

development with the mediating role of effectiveness of curriculum. Hypothesis-8 has been accepted manifesting that role of principals ($\beta = 0.149$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on students' morality development while hypothesis-9 has also been accepted manifesting that role of principals ($\beta = 0.535$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on role of teachers; however, hypothesis-10 has been rejected manifesting that role of principals ($\beta = 0.050$; $p > 0.05$) has a positive but statistically insignificant effect on students' morality development with the mediating role of role of teachers. Hypothesis-11 has been accepted manifesting that role of principals ($\beta = 0.433$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on curriculum effectiveness, whereas hypothesis-12 has also been accepted manifesting that role of principals ($\beta = 0.136$; $p < 0.05$) has a positive effect on students' morality development with the mediating role of curriculum effectiveness.

Furthermore, table 4.4 shows the result of hypothesis-testing for moderation analysis using PLS bootstrapping. In this regards, the findings has shown that hypothesis-13 has been rejected manifesting that socioeconomic support ($\beta = -0.014$; $p > 0.05$) does not moderate the effect of effectiveness of curriculum on students' morality development. Hypothesis-14 has also been rejected manifesting that socioeconomic support ($\beta = 0.046$; $p > 0.05$) does not moderate the effect of role of teachers on students' morality development. Lastly, hypothesis-15 has also been rejected manifesting that socioeconomic support ($\beta = -0.021$; $p > 0.05$) does not moderate the effect of role of principals on students' morality development.

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...
 Table 4.3:

Hypothesis-Testing using PLS Path Modeling Analysis

	Estimate	S. D.	T-Stats	Prob.	Decision
H1: Effectiveness of Curriculum -> Morality Development	0.315	0.084	3.754	0.000	Supported
H2: Role of Teachers -> Morality Development	0.094	0.066	1.418	0.078	Not supported
H3: Teachers' Implicit Beliefs -> Morality Development	0.391	0.070	5.562	0.000	Supported
H4: Teachers' Implicit Beliefs -> Role of Teachers	0.405	0.044	9.257	0.000	Supported
H5: Teachers' Implicit Beliefs -> Role of Teachers -> Morality Development	0.038	0.027	1.420	0.078	Not supported
H6: Teachers' Implicit Beliefs -> Effectiveness of Curriculum	0.497	0.073	6.847	0.000	Supported
H7: Teachers' Implicit Beliefs -> Effectiveness of Curriculum -> Morality Development	0.157	0.047	3.344	0.000	Supported
H8: Role of Principals -> Morality Development	0.149	0.078	1.902	0.029	Supported
H9: Role of Principals -> Role of Teachers	0.535	0.044	12.142	0.000	Supported
H10: Role of Principals -> Role of Teachers -> Morality Development	0.050	0.037	1.374	0.085	Not supported
H11: Role of Principals -> Effectiveness of Curriculum	0.433	0.074	5.815	0.000	Supported
H12: Role of Principals -> Effectiveness of Curriculum -> Morality Development	0.136	0.045	3.042	0.001	Supported

Table 4.4:
Moderation Analysis using PLS Bootstrapping

	Estimate	S. D.	T-Stats	Prob.	Decision
H13: Socioeconomic Support x Effectiveness of Curriculum -> Morality Development	-0.014	0.092	0.158	0.437	Not supported
H14: Socioeconomic Support x Role of Teachers -> Morality Development	0.046	0.067	0.684	0.247	Not supported
H15: Socioeconomic Support x Role of Principals -> Morality Development	-0.021	0.098	0.213	0.416	Not supported

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

5. Discussions

The study showed the significant and positive impact of effectiveness of curriculum on students' morality development. The results are in line with the research of Law (2018), and Suhadi and Warman (2017). Further, the present paper identified that role of principals has a significant and positive impact on effectiveness of curriculum. This result is also consistent with the results of Ullah et al. (2021), and Abboud (2017).

The study results showed that role of principals has a significant and positive impact on role of teachers. The result is similar to the results of Alkhazaleh and Al-Srehan (2019). Also, the research findings demonstrate that role of principals has an insignificant and positive impact on students' morality development. The results are in line with the study of Alkhazaleh and Al-Srehan (2019), and Ghasemzadeh et al. (2021).

The results further revealed that role of teachers have an insignificant and positive impact on students' morality development. The results are similar to the study of Siddiqui and Habib (2021) and Iqbal et al. (2018). The results highlighted that socioeconomic support has an insignificant and positive impact on students' morality development. This finding is consistent with the results of Rai and Prakash (2021).

Moreover, the paper identified that teachers' implicit beliefs has a significant and positive impact on effectiveness of curriculum. The results are in line with the study of Sule (2018). Whereas, teachers' implicit beliefs has a significant and positive impact on role of teachers which is supported by the results of Tao et al. (2021). The current study also showed that teachers' implicit beliefs have a significant and positive impact on students' morality development. This results is in line with the research results of Rissanen et al. (2018).

Furthermore, it can be seen that effectiveness of curriculum and role of principals has an insignificant and negative impact on student's morality development with the moderation effect of socioeconomic conditions. The results are consistent with the papers of Lowery (2019), and Bourke et al. (2020). Whereas, it can be seen that role of teachers has an insignificant and positive impact on student's morality development with the moderation effect of socioeconomic conditions. This is also in line with the results of Kim and Choi (2020). The indirect effect results showed that teachers' implicit beliefs have an insignificant and positive effect on students' morality development with the mediation of the role of teachers. The results are parallel with the results of Burgoon (2018), and Friesen and Cuning (2020). In addition, teachers' implicit beliefs have a positive and significant effect on students' morality development with the mediation of effectiveness of the curriculum. The results are similar to the findings of Gofton and Regehr (2006).

Similarly, the role of principals has an insignificant positive effect on students' morality development with the mediation of the role of teachers. The results are consistent with the studies of Hanhimäki and Tirri (2008), and Gunawan et al. (2017).

Lastly, the role of principals has a positive and significant effect on students' morality development with the mediation of effectiveness of the curriculum. The results are parallel with the results of Segev (2017), and Bamkin (2018).

6. Conclusion and recommendations

The main aim of this study is to examine the development of moral values within students of public sectors schools. The study carefully analyzes the role of moral education (me) offered

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

to students and teachers in developing their moral values. Therefore, the study has selected mixed research paradigm following the phenomenology approach. Since in Pakistan a very little work has been done on moral development thus, the present research conducted the study in Pakistan so as to identify the missing link in the curriculum. For data collection the study chooses the multi-stage random sampling because this type of research methodology allows more complete and synergistic use of data. Moreover, emphasis was given to the concept of change, collaboration and participation in the study that is why it is grounded in participatory worldview. The study shows the results that effectiveness of curriculum, role of teachers, teacher's implicit belief, and role of principals shows the positive effect on student's morality development. In addition, with this, the study analyzes the role of mediators and it has been found that with the mediation role of teachers, effectiveness of curriculum, teacher implicit beliefs have a positive effect on student's morality development. Also, with the mediation role of teachers, effectiveness of curriculum, head teachers show positive impact on student's morality development. Considering moderating effect favorable socioeconomic support of students significantly moderate the effect of effectiveness of curriculum and role of teachers and role of head teachers on student's morality development. Moral development has a significant impact on the environment; therefore morality education is critical in infancy. As a result, a teacher must be able to develop the morals of each student in a variety of acceptable ways. Morality development training should be arranged for teachers and principals. Furthermore, the teacher's efforts to develop student morality by assigning work and collecting from students on time will benefit, one of which is the capacity to establish student discipline through timely assignments. Additionally, teachers should emphasize positive behavior reward rather than negative behavior punishment, adult modeling of moral behavior, and the development of chances. Moreover, students would benefit from the establishment of an ethics curriculum that stresses the development of moral thinking skills and actions. On the other hand, teachers could bring any news having moral significance, whether domestic or foreign, to present and discuss with their students. Moral studies should be aided by stories that are related to virtuous action. Children should always be given the opportunity to interpret story themes. Likewise, the principal's leadership has a substantial and positive impact on the character of students. As a result, efforts should be made to improve the principal's leadership in order to help pupils develop their character. Principals should create a dependable work team. Therefore, principals must be able to offer direction and oversight, enhance the willingness of the teaching staff, establish two-way communication, and distribute work as leaders. Notably, the principal must have a distinct personality, as well as the required abilities, experience, and professional expertise, as well as administrative and supervisory competence. Above that, principals must work hard to influence, encourage, guide, lead, and move teachers, staff, students, parents of students, and serve as a role model for students. Further, it is the teacher's responsibility, in addition to teaching the subject matter, to develop the students and assist them confronts the future. Their distinct implicit ideas, however, appeared to be mirrored in their respective moral ethic. So that, teachers may help to guide their students' moral qualities and assist them get to be the best that they can become. In addition, schools can best promote students' moral growth by assisting instructors in coping with the difficulties of their jobs and developing teachers' capacity for introspection and

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

empathy. Students undoubtedly benefit from community service, being reminded of essential qualities, and developing good habits.

This examination, like any other, makes recommendations for the future. The researchers investigated the opinions of head teachers and instructors, as well as the efficacy of the curriculum in public schools serving grades 1-5. Therefore, researchers can apply this theory on private sector and they can examine higher classes as well. This study has been conducted in Sindh which is one of the provinces of Pakistan while the influence of this methodology may also be assessed in other provinces of Pakistan, and in other countries. Because this study was done in Pakistan, a developing country, the influence of this approach may also be evaluated in developed countries. While there is no mediator and just one moderator in this study, researchers can include mediators and moderators in future studies.

References

1. Abboud, P. (2017). *Supporting a growth mindset in high school classroom teachers* [Brandman University].
2. Abdolmaleki, S., Maleki, H., & Asadi, F. (2018). Effective teaching component of teachers in curriculum planning. *Research in Curriculum Planning, 15*(59), 95-114.
3. Adejumo, M. (2017). Beyond socioeconomic status: The impact of principal leadership in urban and high poverty turnaround schools.
4. Ahmed, M., & Khan, A. M. (2020). Analysis of national educational initiatives (2000-2019) for promoting primary education in Pakistan. *Journal of Educational Research, 23*(1), 131-147.
5. Alkhazaleh, M. S., & Al-Srehan, H. S. (2019). The role of principals and teachers of kindergartens in the development of ethical behavior among children in the UAE. *Ilkogretim Online, 18*(3).
6. Amir, S., Sharf, N., & Khan, R. A. (2020). Pakistan's Education System: An Analysis of Education Policies and Drawbacks. *Electronic Research Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities, 2*.
7. Andedo, J. A., Ajowi, J. O., & Aloka, P. J. (2021). Influence of Principals' Professional Training on Creating Professional Learning Communities in Selected Kenyan Secondary Schools.
8. Asif, T., Guangming, O., Haider, M. A., Colomer, J., & Kayani, S. (2020). Moral education for sustainable development: Comparison of university teachers' perceptions in China and Pakistan. *Sustainability, 12*(7), 3014.
9. Avkiran, N., & Ringle, C. (2018). Partial least squares structural equation modeling. *Handbook of Market Research (Vol. 267)*.
10. Babadjanova, N. (2020). Effective classroom management techniques for curriculum of 21st century. *Science and Education, 1*(7).
11. Bamkin, S. (2018). Reforms to strengthen moral education in Japan: A preliminary analysis of implementation in schools. *Contemporary Japan, 30*(1), 78-96.
12. Bizzo, N., & Caravita, S. (2012). School textbooks and updated sound science: narrowing the gap between classrooms and cutting edge science. In (Vol. 46, pp. 1-3): Taylor & Francis.
13. Bourke, M., Kinsella, W., & Prendeville, P. (2020). The implementation of an ethical education curriculum in secondary schools in Ireland. *Education Sciences, 10*(1), 14-33.
14. Burgoon, J. N. (2018). *The Moral Foundations of Teaching: Measuring Teachers' Implicit Moral Beliefs*. The University of Toledo.
15. Bussey, K., & Hill, D. (2017). Care as curriculum: Investigating teachers' views on the learning in care. *Early Child Development and Care, 187*(1), 128-137.
16. Castillo, J. (2018). Moral Commitment and Ethical Action In the Classroom: Integrating Morality, Ethics, and Values into Curriculum.
17. Cherkowski, S., Kutsyuruba, B., & Walker, K. (2020). Positive leadership: animating purpose,

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

- presence, passion and play for flourishing in schools. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 58(4), 401-415.
18. Cheung, G. W., & Wang, C. (2017). Current approaches for assessing convergent and discriminant validity with SEM: Issues and solutions. Academy of Management Annual Meeting Proceedings, Briarcliff Manor, NY.
 19. Emambokus, W. B. S. (2021). Investigating teachers', students' and parents' perspectives concerning school-based morality education: a case study in a multicultural background in Mauritius. *International Journal of Ethics Education*, 6(1), 21-35.
 20. Erdogan, E., & Cavli, E. (2019). Investigation of Organizational Commitment Levels of Physical Education and Classroom Teachers. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 7(1), 259-265.
 21. Faas, D., Smith, A., & Darmody, M. (2018). The role of principals in creating inclusive school environments: insights from community national schools in Ireland. *School Leadership & Management*, 38(4), 457-473.
 22. Farisia, H. (2020). Nurturing Religious and Moral Values at Early Childhood Education. *Didaktika Religia*, 8(1), 1-27.
 23. Farsakhanova, D. (2020). Improvement of the methodology of spiritual and moral education of students of pedagogical institutions. *Архив Научных Публикаций JSPI*.
 24. Fitria, H., & Suminah, S. (2020). Role of Teachers in Digital Instructional Era. *Journal of Social Work and Science Education*, 1(1), 70-77.
 25. Fornell, C., & Larcker, D. F. (1981). Structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error: Algebra and statistics. *Journal of marketing research*, 18(3), 382-388.
 26. Friesen, D. C., & Cuning, D. (2020). Making explicit pre-service teachers' implicit beliefs about inclusive education. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 24(14), 1494-1508.
 27. Ghasemzadeh, A., Mohammadi, M., & Minaei, H. (2021). Ethical Challenges of School Principals during of COVID-19. *International Journal of Ethics and Society*, 3(1), 15-23.
 28. Ghorai, N. D., Khan, S., & Mohakud, L. L. (2021). Influence of Family Backgrounds on Moral Values in Higher Secondary Students.
 29. Gofton, W., & Regehr, G. (2006). What we don't know we are teaching: unveiling the hidden curriculum. *Clinical Orthopaedics and Related Research*, 449, 20-27.
 30. Grissom, J. A., Egalite, A. J., & Lindsay, C. A. (2021). How Principals Affect Students and Schools: A Systematic Synthesis of Two Decades of Research. Research Report. *Wallace Foundation*.
 31. Gunawan, D., Utanto, Y., & Maretta, Y. A. (2017). An analysis on Indonesian teachers' reasoning in resolving moral dilemmas. *Man In India*, 97(2), 829-841.
 32. Gunawan, I., Bafadal, I., Nurabadi, A., & Prayoga, A. G. (2020). Identification of Themes in the Moral Debate Program as an Effort to Increase Work Integrity of Principal. 2nd Early Childhood and Primary Childhood Education (ECPE 2020),
 33. Haidt, J., & Joseph, C. (2004). Intuitive ethics: How innately prepared intuitions generate culturally variable virtues. *Daedalus*, 133(4), 55-66.
 34. Hair, J. F., Hult, G. T. M., Ringle, C., & Sarstedt, M. (2016). *A primer on partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM)*. Sage Publications.
 35. Hair, J. F., Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2011). PLS-SEM: Indeed a silver bullet. *Journal of Marketing theory and Practice*, 19(2), 139-152.
 36. Hair, J. F., Sarstedt, M., Ringle, C. M., & Mena, J. A. (2012). An assessment of the use of partial least squares structural equation modeling in marketing research. *Journal of the academy of marketing science*, 40(3), 414-433.
 37. Hair Jr, J. F., Sarstedt, M., Hopkins, L., & Kuppelwieser, V. G. (2014). Partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM). *European business review*.
 38. Han, H. (2014). Analysing theoretical frameworks of moral education through Lakatos's philosophy of science. *Journal of Moral Education*, 43(1), 32-53.

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

39. Hanhimäki, E., & Tirri, K. (2008). The moral role and characteristics of Finnish urban school principals. *Journal of Research in Character Education*, 6(1).
40. Hidayah, R. (2021). Students' Self-Adjustment, Self-Control, and Morality. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 12(1), 174-193.
41. Ilaltdinova, E. Y., Frolova, S. V., & Lebedeva, I. V. (2017). Top qualities of great teachers: National and universal. International Conference on Linguistic and Cultural Studies,
42. Iqbal, J., Khaleeq, A. R., & Ramzan, M. (2018). Role of Teachers in Moral Development of Primary Level Students. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 28(2), 97-106.
43. Juharyanto, J., Arifin, I., Bafadal, I., Sobri, A. Y., & Nurabadi, A. (2018). Dominant leadership of school principals in the implementation of curriculum 2013 in religious based school Indonesia. *Asia Proceedings of Social Sciences*, 2(4), 47-51.
44. Julia, J., Supriatna, E., Isrokatun, I., Aisyah, I., Nuryani, R., & Odebode, A. A. (2020). Moral Education (2010-2019): A Bibliometric Study (Part 1). *Online Submission*, 8(6), 2554-2568.
45. Kavakli, N., & Arslan, S. (2019). Revisiting the role of an EFL teacher as an educational leader: conceptions and perceptions. In *Selected Discussions on Social Science Research* (pp. 661-682). Frontpage Publications.
46. Khan, S. R., Bauman, D. C., & Javed, U. (2020). A study on the effect of ethical leadership on teachers' moral motivation at schools in Pakistan. *International Journal of Educational Management*.
47. Khanam, A., & Idris, M. (2020). Morality or Mechanics: A Dilemma for Educational Leaders of 21st Century. *Research Journal of Social Sciences and Economics Review*, 1(1), 38-55.
48. Khotimah, K., Widiati, U., Mustofa, M., & Ubaidillah, M. F. (2019). Autonomous English learning: Teachers' and students' perceptions. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 9(2), 371-381.
49. Kim, K. R., & Seo, E. H. (2018). The relationship between teacher efficacy and students' academic achievement: A meta-analysis. *Social Behavior and Personality: an international journal*, 46(4), 529-540.
50. Kim, Y., & Choi, M. (2020). Towards critical multicultural teacher education in the midst of ethno-nationalism: Korean pre-service teachers' international learning experiences. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 96, 103155.
51. Krejcie, R. V., & Morgan, D. W. (1970). Determining sample size for research activities. *Educational and psychological measurement*, 30(3), 607-610.
52. Kristjánsson, K. (2020). An introduction to the special issue on wisdom and moral education. In: Taylor & Francis.
53. Kuusisto, E., & Tirri, K. (2019). Teachers' moral competence in pedagogical encounters. In *Education for Democratic Intercultural Citizenship* (pp. 81-106). Brill Sense.
54. Law, E. H.-f. (2018). Reorienting curriculum practices in changing Asian societies. In *Routledge international handbook of schools and schooling in Asia* (pp. 75-76). Routledge.
55. Liebowitz, D. D., & Porter, L. (2019). The effect of principal behaviors on student, teacher, and school outcomes: A systematic review and meta-analysis of the empirical literature. *Review of Educational Research*, 89(5), 785-827.
56. Lowery, C. (2019). Moral literacy and school leadership: Perceptions of principals in southeast Ohio on the ethics of decision-making. *Journal of Educational Administration*.
57. Malone, D. (2017). Socioeconomic status: A potential challenge for parental involvement in schools. *Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin*, 83(3), 58-62.
58. Mashburn, A. J., Hamre, B. K., Downer, J. T., & Pianta, R. C. (2006). Teacher and classroom characteristics associated with teachers' ratings of prekindergartners' relationships and behaviors. *Journal of psychoeducational assessment*, 24(4), 367-380.
59. Moltudal, S., Krumsvik, R., Jones, L., Eikeland, O. J., & Johnson, B. (2019). The Relationship between Teachers' Perceived Classroom Management Abilities and Their Professional Digital Competence: Experiences from Upper Secondary Classrooms. A Qualitative Driven Mixed Method Study. *Designs*

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

- for Learning, 11(1), 80-98.
60. Narvaez, D. (2021). Moral education in a time of human ecological devastation. *Journal of Moral Education, 50*(1), 55-67.
61. Naseer, H., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2020). Critical Thinking Skills in a Secondary School Pakistan Studies Textbook: A Qualitative Content Analysis. *sjesr, 3*(4), 84-95.
62. NEP. (2017). *NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY 2017*. G. o. Pakistan. <https://pbit.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/National%20Educaton%20Policy%202017.pdf>
63. Nias, J. (1998). Why teachers need their colleagues: A developmental perspective. In *International handbook of educational change* (pp. 1257-1271). Springer.
64. Nishanbayeva, S., Kolumbayeva, S., Satynskaya, A., Zhiyenbayeva, S., Seiitkazy, P., & Kalbergenova, S. (2021). Some instructional problems in the formation of family and moral values of students. *World Journal on Educational Technology: Current Issues, 13*(3), 529-545.
65. Omar, S. (2018). An Investigation on the Perspectives of Parents on the Impact of the Western Teachers' Values and Cultures on Developing their Children's Character and Morality. Proceedings of the 8th international RAIS conference on social sciences,
66. Pijanowski, J. C., Hewitt, P. M., & Brady, K. P. (2009). Superintendents' perceptions of the principal shortage. *NASSP Bulletin, 93*(2), 85-95.
67. Polat, S. (2018). An analysis of the multi-cultural characteristics of the pre-service teachers in terms of the values they have.
68. Pratama, E., & Ridha, M. (2019). Relationship Between Parents Socio Economic Status and Students Interest in Continuing to Vocational High School. *Jurnal Neo Konseling, 1*(1).
69. Rai, A., & Prakash, A. (2021). Leadership Competencies and Work Place Values: Keys to School Effectiveness in Public and Private Schools. *International Journal of Applied, 11*(1), 24-41.
70. Rissanen, I., Kuusisto, E., Hanhimäki, E., & Tirri, K. (2018). The implications of teachers' implicit theories for moral education: A case study from Finland. *Journal of Moral Education, 47*(1), 63-77.
71. Sailin, S. N., & Mahmor, N. A. (2018). Improving student teachers' digital pedagogy through meaningful learning activities. *Malaysian Journal of Learning and Instruction, 15*(2), 143-173.
72. Segev, A. (2017). Does classic school curriculum contribute to morality? Integrating school curriculum with moral and intellectual education. *Educational Philosophy and Theory, 49*(1), 89-98.
73. Shabani Azadboni, M., & Safari, M. (2020). The relationship between professional ethics and conflict management in high school principals in the west of Mazandaran province. *Management and Educational Perspective, 2*(2), 59-76.
74. Shamshiri, M. R. (2017). The Impact of Moral Education on Religious Life. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research, 6*(1), 763-776.
75. Shen, W., Huang, Y., & Fan, W. (2020). Morality and ability: institutional leaders' perceptions of ideal leadership in Chinese research universities. *Studies in Higher Education, 45*(10), 2092-2100.
76. Siddiqui, R., & Habib, Z. (2021). Moral Education at Primary Level in Selected Private Schools of Karachi: Role of Teachers and Parents. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 9*(2), 59-73.
77. Sider, S., Maich, K., & Morvan, J. (2017). School principals and students with special education needs: Leading inclusive schools. *Canadian Journal of Education/Revue canadienne de l'éducation, 40*(2), 1-31.
78. Suhadi, N., & Warman, S. (2017). Research Proposal: Effectiveness of Curriculum Activity towards the Establishment of Identity of Students of Higher Education Institutions in the Present.
79. Sule, D. S. (2018). *Theory-practice integration in radiography education: the role of teaching strategies*. The University of Liverpool (United Kingdom).
80. Tao, V. Y., Li, Y., Lam, K. H., Leung, C. W., Sun, C. I., & Wu, A. M. (2021). From teachers' implicit theories of intelligence to job stress: The mediating role of teachers' causal attribution of students'

Students' Morality Development in Primary Public Schools of Sindh Province:...

academic achievement. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 51(5), 522-533.

81. Ullah, O., Arshad, U., & Malik, U. (2021). How School Leader Implement the Curriculum? Problems, Prospects, and Way Forward. *Global Educational Studies Review*, VI, 6, 314-330.
82. Uwaezuoke, M.-R. I. (2020). Teaching ethics and morality education in Nigerian schools for sustainable development. *UNIZIK Journal of Educational Research and Policy Studies*, 1(1), 36-45.
83. von Stumm, S. (2017). Socioeconomic status amplifies the achievement gap throughout compulsory education independent of intelligence. *Intelligence*, 60, 57-62.
84. Wanders, F. H., Dijkstra, A. B., Maslowski, R., & Van der Veen, I. (2020). The effect of teacher-student and student-student relationships on the societal involvement of students. *Research Papers in Education*, 35(3), 266-286.
85. Wentzel, K. R., Russell, S., & Baker, S. (2016). Emotional support and expectations from parents, teachers, and peers predict adolescent competence at school. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 108(2), 242-255.